

# Gas Chromatography–Mass Spectrometry (GC–MS) Characterization of Volatile Compounds in Quality Vinegars with Protected European Geographical Indication

Fabio Chinnici,<sup>\*,†</sup> Enrique Durán Guerrero,<sup>‡</sup> Francesca Sonni,<sup>†</sup> Nadia Natali,<sup>†</sup> Ramón Natera Marín,<sup>‡</sup> and Claudio Riponi<sup>†</sup>

<sup>\*</sup>Food Science Department, University of Bologna, Viale Fanin, 40, Bologna 40127, Italy, and <sup>\*</sup>Analytical Chemistry Department, Faculty of Sciences, University of Cádiz, Post Office Box 40, Pol. Río San Pedro, Puerto Real 11510, Cádiz, Spain

The volatile composition of 26 premium quality vinegars belonging to three different protected geographical indications (traditional balsamic vinegar of Modena, balsamic vinegar of Modena, and sherry vinegar) has been characterized by means of a solid-phase extraction (SPE) gas chromatography-mass spectrometry GC-MS method. Among the about 90 quantified compounds, short-chain fatty acids, furanic compounds, enolic derivatives, and some esters were found to discriminate the samples as a consequence of differences in the extent of Maillard reactions, presence of alcoholic fermentation, or duration of wood aging.

KEYWORDS: Traditional balsamic vinegar of Modena; balsamic vinegar of Modena; sherry vinegar; vinegar aroma; GC-MS; SPE; volatile compounds; furanic compounds

## INTRODUCTION

In the European Union, the promotion of foods that have been recognized to be traditionally linked to a certain geographical area is based on a legislative system known as "protected denomination" (1). Nowadays, most of the member states possess a number of food specialties with a protected designation of origin (PDO) or a protected geographical indication (PGI), with each of them obtained following approved specifications related to their chemical-sensory features, their production process, and certification.

For what concern vinegars, at the European level, two different PDOs exist: (i) traditional balsamic vinegar of Modena (TBVM) and (ii) traditional balsamic vinegar of Reggio Emilia (TBVRE) (2). Two further specialties are the sherry vinegar (JVs), a product which has its own denomination of origin and has recently been accepted by the European Commission as PDO (3), and balsamic vinegar of Modena (BVM), which is under consideration of the European Commission, with its geographical indication now temporarily protected (4).

TBVM and TBVRE are Italian vinegars coming from the Emilia-Romagna region, differing almost exclusively from the production area and the grape cultivars used to obtain the starting must. They consist of a dark, syrupy sausage, in which the sour notes are well-balanced by a sweet background deriving from the initial unfermented must. Briefly, for TBVM, the process starts with the cooking of the grape must in open boilers to reduce the initial volume of about 30%. During this phase, conditions are propitious for the development of caramelization and Maillard reactions (5) that generate compounds, some of which with a

remarkable aromatic impact. Once cooked, the must is transferred to a cask, where a partial alcoholic fermentation takes place (up to 70 g/L of ethanol). After 5 or 6 months, the acetic fermentation process is promoted and the product is divided into some smaller casks (typically five) made of different kinds of wood (oak, chestnut, mulberry, or juniper) and decreasing volume. During this period, acetic acid bacteria grow on the media surface, where the oxygen concentration is higher. Vinegar oxidation is produced mainly by strains belonging to Acetobacter, Gluconobacter, and Gluconacetobacter species, which oxidize ethanol to acetic acid (6). A long aging period follows during which, because of evaporation, casks are refilled using the method consisting of taking the finished product from the smaller cask (the fifth cask) and refilling it with the vinegar coming from the fourth cask. Then, the fourth cask is subsequently refilled from the third cask and so on until the larger cask (the first), which is filled with fresh cooked must. Only after at least 12 years of aging, the vinegar could be withdrawn to be marketed as TBVM, while for the older "Extravecchio" vinegar, the aging should be at least 25 years.

Balsamic vinegar of Modena (BVM) differs from the abovecited TBVM in the fact that it substantially comes from a wine vinegar, to which a minor portion of cooked must and caramel have been added, and that it has undergone a shorter aging period (from 6 months to 2 years) usually in one single oak cask. Finally, sherry vinegar (JVs) is a Spanish D.O. produced in the Jerez-Xérès-Sherry wine region (Andalucía) and derives from a wine vinegar aged in casks often following the traditional "solera" method, where a volume of older vinegar from the "solera" (placed on the ground) line of casks is bottled. This volume is refilled with younger vinegar from another line of casks and so on until the line of casks with the youngest vinegar, which is refilled

<sup>\*</sup>To whom the correspondence should be addressed. Telephone: + 39512096015. Fax: + 39512096017. E-mail: fabio.chinnici@unibo.it.

#### Table 1. Principal Characteristics of the Studied Samples

vinegar	code	studied samples	raw material	aging type	aging time	caramel addition
traditional balsamic vinegar of Modena "extravecchio"	TBVM-ST	5	cooked must	dynamic	>25 years	no
traditional balsamic vinegar of Modena "affinato"	TBVM-AF	5	cooked must	dynamic	>12 years	no
sherry vinegar	VJ	4	sherry wine	dynamic	>6 months	no
sherry vinegar reserva	VR	6	sherry wine	dynamic	>2 years	no
balsamic vinegar of Modena	BVM	6	wine	static	<3 years	yes

with no aged vinegar. The complete process can take at least 6 months (Vinagre de Jerez, VJ) or 2 years (Reserva, VR). Very recently, a further category of JVs, aged at least 10 years (Gran Reserva), has been introduced (*3*).

Apart from the different raw material (the grape) and the geographical area, all of these vinegars share some production similarities and, at the same time, differ for specific technological phases that overall could contribute to their organoleptic complexity and diversity. For instance, all of them undergo acetic fermentation and wood aging (even, in some cases, of different duration).

On the other hand, only BVM and JVs come from an alcoholic raw material (the wine), while TBVM is produced from partially fermented musts. Moreover, caramelization and Maillard reactions only occur in the TBVM production process (during the cooking of the must), while the dynamic production method is characteristic of both TBVM and JVs.

Undoubtedly, from a sensorial point of view, one of the most important features of such vinegars, along with taste, is the aromatic impact. The volatile composition of these vinegars has been the subject of previous independent studies (7-12), with most of them carried out by means of the gas chromatography– mass spectrometry (GC–MS) technique. However, because of differences in sampling, sample extraction, and analytical procedures, bibliographic data are difficult to be compared. Although some of the studied compounds have been described previously in this kind of samples, a comprehensive assessment of the composition in volatile compounds of these premium quality vinegars is still lacking.

Solid-phase extraction (SPE) is a well-known extraction technique that can be applied directly to liquid samples to extract volatile compounds. Dependent upon the polymeric phase and solvent employed, a wide range of different compounds can be analyzed. In addition, contrary to other newer techniques, this technique is more economic and easy to use. On the other hand, this technique presents difficulties of automation and a relatively higher consumption of solvent. In a previous work, a SPE method has been developed for the analysis of volatile compounds in traditional balsamic vinegars and other kind of vinegars (13). The aim of the present work is, hence, to carry out an exhaustive characterization of the volatile composition of TBVM, BVM, and JVs by means of an SPE method applied to GC-MS analysis to establish the main volatile compound differences and its later correlation with the technological process applied and the raw material used.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

**Samples.** A total of 10 TBVM (5 > 12 years old "affinato" and 5 > 25 years old "extravecchio") supplied by different Italian producers, 6 BVM (<3 years old) purchased from an Italian market, and 10 JVs (4 > 6 months old "vinagre de Jerez" and 6 > 2 years old "vinagre de Jerez Reserva") purchased from a Spanish market were analyzed. The acidity of the samples (expressed in grams of acetic acid/100 g of vinegar) varied from 5 to 7 for TBVM and from 7 to 10 for JVs. The acidity of BVM was 6% for all of the samples. With this limited number of studied vinegars (26 samples), the different types of products were covered. Furthermore,

traditional Italian vinegars were relatively difficult to obtain because of their high value. **Table 1** shows the principal characteristics of the studied samples.

Sample Extraction. Sample extraction was carried out according to Durán Guerrero et al. (13) using a SPE technique. LiChrolut-EN cartridges (200 mg, Merck, Darmstadt, Germany) were conditioned with 4 mL of dichloromethane, followed by 4 mL of methanol and 4 mL of water.

A total of 7 g of sample, diluted 1:4 in Milli-Q water, was deposed at about 1.5 mL/min onto the cartridge. After this and without taking the cartridge to dryness, a process of washing with 5 mL of water was carried out. After the washing process, the cartridge was dried by air passage. The volatile compounds were recovered by elution with 10 mL of dichloromethane. The eluted sampled were stored a -18 °C for at least 24 h to freeze the remaining water. Then, the samples were filtered, and  $100 \,\mu$ L of I.S. solution were added to the filtered sample. Finally, a volume of approximately 0.5 mL was attained by evaporation using nitrogen.

**GC–MS.** A total of 2  $\mu$ L of the extract were injected in the splitless mode (splitless time of 0.60 min) into a Thermo Finnigan Trace GC ultra gas chromatograph (San Jose, CA), equipped with a Thermo Finnigan Trace DSQ selective mass detector, a Merlin Microseal injector, and a fused silica capillary column Stabilwax (Restek, Bellefonte, PA), 30 m, 0.25 mm inner diameter, and 0.25  $\mu$ m film thickness, under the following working conditions: GC-grade helium as a carrier gas at flow rate (costant flow, vacuum compensation) of 1.0 mL/min; 62 kPa; column temperature program, 35 °C heated at 3 °C/min to 100 °C and then heated at 5 °C/min to 240 °C (held for 10 min). The injection temperature was 250 °C. Detection was carried out by electron ionization mass (EI) in the full scan mode, using an ionization energy of 70 eV and transfer line at 220 °C. The mass acquisition range was 30–400 amu.

Peak identification was carried out using the NIST 2.0 and Wiley 7.0 libraries by analogy of mass spectra and confirmed by retention times of standards (when available). Furthermore, the retention index (RI) of each tentatively identified compound was compared to the RI found in the literature. Quantitative data from the identified compounds were obtained by measuring the relative quantifying ions peak area in relation to that of I.S. ( $50 \,\mu$ L of a 514 mg L<sup>-1</sup> solution of 2-octanol were added to 10 mL of each sample) and building calibration curves for each compound for which the standard was at our disposal. For compounds lacking reference standards (34 compounds), quantification was carried out by using the calibration curves of standards with similar chemical structures, obtained in the TIC mode. These were the following: 3-ethoxy-1-propanol, vanillin, benzaldehyde, butyric acid, decanoic acid, triacetin, maltol, 2-acetyl furan, furoic acid,  $\gamma$ -butyrolactone, and guaiacol.

**Statistical Analysis.** The whole set of data was submitted to an analysis of variation (ANOVA) analysis followed by a post-hoc comparison test (Tuckey's test) and to a principal component analysis (PCA) using "Statistica 6" software package (StatSoft Italia).

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The volatile compounds identified in vinegars are reported in **Table 2**. Although the used method is not suitable to determine major volatile compounds (acetaldehyde, ethanol, methanol, and ethyl acetate), a total of 93 compounds were identified, 57 of which were confirmed by comparing their rT and mass spectra with authentic standards. For the remaining volatiles, identification was accomplished by matching their mass spectra with Nist 2.0 and Wiley 7 libraries and further confirmed by the comparison to linear retention indexes (RIs) found in the literature (7–12). Identified volatiles were grouped in function of the chemical class,

Table 2. Quantification and Identification Criteria for Volatile Compounds Identified in at Least One Vinegar Sample

1     1142     1.54arad     isamply-filteratad     isamply-filteratad     S. M.S     Marce       3     3.methy-filteratad     isamply-filteratad     S. M.S     Signa       5     1260     altyticory-filteratad     S. M.S     Signa       6     1270     basyl acada     S. M.S     Signa       7     1280     altyticory-filteratad     acada     S. M.S     Signa       7     1280     altyticory-filteratad     acada     S. M.S     Signa       10     1379     -filteratad     S. M.S     Marce     Signa     Africor       11     1393     -filteratad     Filteratad     Signa     Africor     Signa     Africor       12     1447     tetratadcare     Signa     Signa     Signa     Africor       13     1443     inatiol code isome     Lutrat     Signa     Signa     Signa       14     1448     2-uproned visit     Lutrat     Signa     Signa     Signa       15     1470     Signalisome     Lutrat <th>number</th> <th><math>RI^{a}</math></th> <th>compound</th> <th>other name</th> <th>quantification<sup>b</sup></th> <th>identification<sup>c</sup></th> <th>supplier<sup>d</sup></th>	number	$RI^{a}$	compound	other name	quantification <sup>b</sup>	identification <sup>c</sup>	supplier <sup>d</sup>
2     1208     3-mtpti-l-dutamina     Bounyl alcohal     54, 70     5, 81     Mode       4     1246     3-hytory-S-mtbyl-2-batanone     NO     MS       5     1257     hotyl acadati     Acada S. MS     Signa       6     1277     hotyl acadati     Acada S. MS     Signa       7     1268     3-hytory-2-batanone     acatain     43     45     S. MS     Signa       7     1268     3-hytory-2-batanone     acatain     64     71     S. MS     Additional       11     1379     3-actory-2-batanone     acatain     64     71     S. MS     Additional       12     1470     Intalio cade isome     Intalio cade isome     64     7.     S. MS     Fill       13     1443     Intalio cade isome     10     10.     84, 70     S. MS     Signa       14     1479     Intalio cade isome     10     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10.     10. </td <td>1</td> <td>1142</td> <td>1-butanol</td> <td></td> <td>56</td> <td>S. MS</td> <td>Aldrich</td>	1	1142	1-butanol		56	S. MS	Aldrich
3     1240     ethylicky-Schutznes     5     5     5, MS     Symit       5     1255     dhylory-Schutznes     43     5, MS     Symit       7     1286     anylory-Schutznes     43     5, MS     Symit       7     1286     anylory-Schutznes     44     45     5, MS     Symit       8     1384     ethyl lacasit     44     5, MS     Symit       9     1380     4-hylory-Ansthyl-Spantanon     46     5, MS     Symit       11     139     3-soctlary-Factoranic     59     5, MS     Filds       12     1440     1anatolo also is norer     59     5, MS     Filds       13     1443     1anatolo also is norer     59     5, MS     Filds       14     146     2-unnarchoxalabi-pace     59     5, MS     Filds       14     146     2-underbind     56     16     5, MS     Filds       15     147.2     bandard also bane     16     5, MS     Filds     5, MS     Filds<	2	1208	3-methyl-1-butanol	isoamyl alcohol	55 + 70	S, MS	Merck
4     3.1.5.0.0.3.1.5.1.5.1.5.1.5.1.5.1.5.1.5.1.5.1.5.1	3	1240	ethyl hexanoate		88	S, MS	Sigma
5     dip/doc/2.dia/nonce     MQ     MQ     Advich       7     1286     3hydrog-2.duatorie     action     43 +45     5, MS     Sgma       9     1360     4.hydrog-2.duatorie     action     64 +45     5, MS     Sgma       9     1360     4.hydrog-4.nethyl-2.pathatorie     diatorie abchol     69 + 7.     5, MS     Advich       11     1363     3.ethonyl-pathatorie     MQ     MA     Advich       12     1407     biatorie abchol     68 + 71     5, MS     MA     MA       13     1469     hudrosthonaldehyde     furthat     104     104     S, MS     Figure       14     1469     hudrosthonaldehyde     furthat     104     105     S, MS     Sgma       15     147     biatoria diatoria     furthat     106 + 106     S, MS     Sgma       16     154     biatoria diatoria     furthat     104 + 100     S, MS     Sgma       16     167     biatoria diatoria     furthat     106 + 106     S, MS	4	1246	3-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-butanone		59	S, MS	Sigma
6     1270     heyd actabile     45     S, MS     Algebra       8     1348     ethyl loctale     achoin     45     S, MS     Sigma       9     1360     ethyl loctale     file achoin     59     S, MS     Sigma       10     1379     3ethony-forscanol     idiactore alcohol     59     S, MS     Alcohol       11     1380     3auditoxy-forscanol     idiactore alcohol     59     7.71     S, MS     Sigma       12     Heide linicitation     Sectore     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma       13     1472     Includo avoid isoma     function     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma       14     1469     Ibulanedid diacotable biomar     truttal     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma       15     147     Ibulanedid diacotable biomar     Tita     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma       16     149     Ibulanedid diacotable biomar     Tita     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     S	5	1265	dihydro-2-methyl-3(2H)-furanone		NQ	MS	-
7     1286     3-hydroxy-buttanone     action     43 + 45     S. MS     Sigma       9     1380     4-hydroxy-4-methyd-2gratanone     idention a lachol     59     S. MS     Sigma       11     1380     3-enthory-1-sopmonl     59     S. MS     Addroh       12     1407     Marcellow 2-buttanone     59     S. MS     Addroh       13     1443     Itanoid coxis borner     59     S. MS     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Fild     Sigma	6	1279	hexyl acetate		43	S, MS	Aldrich
8     1948     ethylicatab     45     S. MS     Sigma       9     1360     4-hylicary-t-proganol     diacatona alcohol     59     7.1     S. MS     Adrich       11     1373     3-artoxy-t-proganol     MC     MS       12     1467     tatado code bottor     19     5.7     S. MS     Adrich       12     1467     tatado code bottor     19     5.4     S. MS     Fukat       13     1443     Linado code bottor     19     10.4     MS     Sigma       14     1467     Linado code bottor     2-furymetry lectone     19     10.4     MS     Sigma       15     1472     Linado code dottate bottor     7     7     MS     MS       16     1427     bottored dottate bottor     7     17.6     MS     MS       21     1567     Singhi Andreshte bottor     7     17.6     MS     Sigma       22     1564     Andreshte bottor     7     MS     Sigma     Sigma     Sigma     Si	7	1286	3-hydroxy-2-butanone	acetoin	43 + 45	S, MS	Sigma
9     1380     4-htps:/-perspania     59     S, MS     Signal       11     1389     3-autosy-2-butanone     59     S, MS     Adeion       12     147     Italian     59     S, MS     Filame       13     1443     Ination cade isome     59     S, MS     Filame       14     1480     Ination cade isome     59     S, MS     Filame       16     1472     Ination cade isome     2-lunamethyle isome     59     S, MS     S, MS     Signal       17     1507     2-asephram     2-lunyimethyle isome     106     S, MS     Signal       18     1521     benzalicitych     107     MS     Signa     Addition       19     1524     benzalicitych     50     S, MS     Signa     MS       21     1597     butanoid dicatabia isome     TC     MS     Signa       23     1597     butanoid dicatabia isome     TC     MS     Signa       24     1597     butanoid dicatabia isome     TC	8	1348	ethyl lactate		45	S, MS	Sigma
10     1379     3-ethony-frequent     NG     MI       11     1380     3-enelloxy-frequento     NG     MI       12     1447     tradicion do isoiner     15     NS     MI       13     1443     Linadoi do do isoiner     15     NS     NS     NS     NS       14     1469     Zhannacatoxaldenyde     Infund     15     NS     NS <td>9</td> <td>1360</td> <td>4-hydroxy-4-methyl-2-pentanone</td> <td>diacetone alcohol</td> <td>59</td> <td>S, MS</td> <td>Sigma</td>	9	1360	4-hydroxy-4-methyl-2-pentanone	diacetone alcohol	59	S, MS	Sigma
11   138   3-acellon/2-butance   NO   MS     13   1443   initial oxide isome   89   71   S, MS   Filuka     13   1443   initial oxide isome   89   96   S, MS   Sigma     15   1472   initial oxide isome   2-butance isolaticable isome   86   10   MS   Sigma     16   1472   initial oxide isome   2-butance isolaticable isome   86   10   S, MS   Filuka     17   1507   2-acelyfluan   2-butance isolaticable isome   43   65   106   S, MS   Filuka     18   121   butance isolaticable isome   70   74   45   55     133   147   situaticable isome   70   74   45   55     14   149   -isolaticable isothere   TO   MS   Sigma     24   1577   isolaticable isome   TO   MS   Filuka     25   1584   -isolaticable isome   TO   MS   Filuka     24   1577   situatisothere   TO   MS   Filuka<	10	1379	3-ethoxy-1-propanol		59 + 71	S, MS	Aldrich
12     1407     tetradecare     58 + 71     S, MS     Aldrich       14     1488     2-kurnachtokaldehyde     furfural     59 + 95     S, MS     Sigma       15     1472     burnneutor disestate former     TC     MS     TC       16     1407     burnneutor disestate former     TC     MS     S, MS     S, MS     S, MS     Aldrich       18     1521     berzaldehyde     TC     MS     S, MS     Aldrich       21     1547     propamoic add     TC     MS     S, MS     S, MS     S, MS     S, MS     S, MS     Aldrich       22     155     1,2-tannedio disoctate former     TC     MS     S, MS     Fuka       23     157     shoutyrs add     TC     MS     S, MS     Fuka       24     157     isoburyr add     TC     MS     S, MS     Fuka       25     154     -/-autarichaldehyde     5-methyl-Lindarcho     MS     Fuka       25     157     drightor-4-methyl2(3)-furancne     y	11	1389	3-acetiloxy-2-butanone		NQ	MS	
13     1443     Induct outle some     59     5, MS     Pluka       15     447     Initiatio outle some     104 method outle some     59     5, MS     Sigma       15     1472     Initiatio outle some     24uryImethyl ketone     59     10     5, MS     Sigma       16     1477     balanedid diseates isomer     24uryImethyl ketone     59     10     5, MS     Pluka       19     1524     ethyl 3-hydroxybulfale     43     5, MS     Sigma       21     1563     12-stancial dioactate isomer     73     74     5, MS     Sigma       22     1563     12-stancial dioactate isomer     TC     MS     Sigma       23     167     5-methyl-2-lauracatoxouldehyde     5-methyl furtural     109<+110	12	1407	tetradecane		85 + 71	S, MS	Aldrich
14     149     2 brancactoroalsetynde     nutural     9b + 96     S, MS     Signa       16     1447     buancedic discents former     TC     MS     S/MS     TC     MS     MS     TC     MS     TC     MS     MS     TC     MS     MS     TC	13	1443	linalool oxide isomer		59	S, MS	Fluka
13     14/2     Initial of locket some*     39     S, MS     Filture       17     1507     2-abalyllutan     2-furylmethyl ketone     95     1.0     S, MS     Filture       18     1521     berazialshyde     43     S, MS     Filture     43     S, MS     Filture       19     1524     ethyl 3-hydroxylutare     43     AS     S, MS     Filture       21     1557     1.2-ethandod lokaetate     63     NB     S, MS     Filture       22     1556     1.2-ethandod lokaetate     5-methyl furfural     109     10     S, MS     Filture       23     1567     5-methyl 4-branactroxoadehyde     5-methyl furfural     109     10     S, MS     Filture       24     1577     1sobutyric add     TC     MS     100     100     MS <td>14</td> <td>1469</td> <td>2-furancarboxaldehyde</td> <td>furtural</td> <td>95 + 96</td> <td>S, MS</td> <td>Sigma</td>	14	1469	2-furancarboxaldehyde	furtural	95 + 96	S, MS	Sigma
16     1497     Ditabeloi dascetta isomer     11.0     NS       18     1521     benzaldehyde     105 + 100     S, NS     Ridata       18     1521     benzaldehyde     105 + 100     S, NS     Ridata       21     1547     propanoi caidi     73 + 74     S, MS     Signa       22     1555     1.2-etametio diacetta isomer     73 + 74     S, MS     Signa       23     1667     5-methyl-2-tamentoxatlehyde     6-methyl furfural     109 + 110     S, MS     Signa       24     1577     isotutyric acid     TC     MS     TC     MS       25     1594     d-viarelocatione     7     TC     MS     TG     MS       26     1517     isotutyric acid     TC     MS     TG     MS       28     1611     dhiydro-4-methyl-2/alp/Laronone     7-bullrolactone     42 + 65     S, MS     Ridia       30     1627     butanoica acid     fora     S, MS     S     S     S     S     S     S     S<	15	14/2	linalool oxide isomer		59	S, MS	Fluka
1     120.1     2-dutymetry keene     65 + 103     5, MS     Signal       18     1521     bernacide/de     105 + 103     5, MS     Aldrich       19     1524     ethyl 3-hydroxpluriate     43     43     5, MS     Aldrich       21     1557     1.2-etherodic diacetate isomer     73 - 74     5, MS     Signa       23     1567     5-methyl-2-duracetoxadehyde     5-methyl furtural     109 + 110     5, MS     Signa       24     1577     isobutyr-2-duracetoxadehyde     5-methyl furtural     109 + 100     5, MS     Signa       25     1594     -/valerolacione     TC     MS     7     1010     5, MS     Fluka       26     1597     divigrot-2-gly-furance     NO     MS     7     1011     2-acetyr-1-propanol     TC     MS       27     1601     2-acetyr-1-propanol     TC     MS     Kidch       28     1617     2-acetory-1-propanol     TC     MS     Kidch       31     1667     4-hydroxy-2-yetomono-     furtury	16	1497	butanediol diacetate Isomer	O funder attend lasters a		MS 0.MC	0:
18     124     untratiseryole     104     105     <	10	1507		2-turyimetnyi ketone	95 + 110	5, M5	Sigma
19     16.2     101 St.4     51 MS     Auture       20     1534     butanedol diacetate isomer     TC     MS       21     1557     5 - methyl-2-turanetosalehyde     5 - methyl-1     S, MS     Sigma       23     1567     5 - methyl-2-turanetosalehyde     5 - methyl-1     MS     Sigma       24     1577     6 - methyl-2-turanetosalehyde     - methyl-2-turanetosalehyde     TC     MS       25     1594     - v-aleroiactone     NQ     MS     -       25     1591     - v-aleroiactone     NQ     MS     -       26     1597     - duranetosaco     y-butrolactone     TC     MS       27     1601     2-adechyl-furanone     - v-butrolactone     TC     MS       28     1617     2-adechyl-furanone     - v-butrolactone     RG     S, MS     Fluka       30     1627     butanotic acid     Go     S, MS     S, MS     S, MS       31     1664     propanetidi diacetate isomer     TC     MS     S, MS     S, MS	10	1521	penzaldenyde		105 + 106	5, M5	Fluka
42     154     Understand balacterize solution     10.9     NS     Signa       22     1555     1.2-standeliol disciplitate solution     43.9     A66     S, MS     Filade       23     1567     5-methyl/Lutancathocaldhyde     5-methyl/Lutrural     109.4     100.5     S, MS     Signa       24     1577     isbothyric acid     TC     MS     Signa       25     1594     A-valarioadone     TC     MS     Signa       26     1611     2-acethyf-tranone     y-butroliactone     42.4     66     S, MS     Fluka       28     1617     2-acethyf-tranone     y-butroliactone     TC     MS     TC     MS       30     1627     butanoic acid     propaneoli diacetate isome     TC     MS     TC     MS       31     1644     propaneoli diacetate isome     TC     MS     Signa     Addrini       32     1667     4-hydroxy-3-pertanoic acid y-lactone     angelicalactone     98 + 55     S, MS     Signa       33     1673     ab	19	1524	etriyi 3-nyuroxyuutrate		43 TIC	5, IVI5	Alunch
1     1.24     1.	20	154	propagoio acid		72 + 74		Sigmo
1     1.0.0     1.4 statustication     1.0.0     5, MS     Final       23     1577     5.methyl/statustication     TC     MS       24     1577     isotutyric acid     TC     MS       25     1594     0-valericatone     TC     MS       26     1597     dihydro-4.methyl-2.diyAruanone     TC     MS       28     1611     dihydro-2.gi/H-furanone     y-butfolactone     47.e6     S, MS     Fluka       29     1617     2.aeoty/-propanol     TC     MS     1064     MS     1064     propanetiol diaestate lowner     TC     MS     1064     MS     1064     propanetiol diaestate lowner     TC     MS     1064     MS     1064     S, MS     Sigma     36     36     1673     sapertanoic acid     aprolactone     aprolactone     86     5, MS     Aldrich       36     1673     definy succhate     TTC     MS     36     1742     propanetiol diaestate lowner     TC     MS     36     36     1673     definy succhate	21	1555	1.2-etapedial diacetate		13 + 86	S, MS	Fluka
C3     10.0     0.1112 (mitration control in the methy inclusion)     10.0     0.1112 (mitration)       24     1574     -/	22	1567	5-methyl-2-furancarboxaldabyda	5-methyl furfural	$40 \pm 00$	S, MS	Sigma
	20	1577	isobutyric acid	5-meanyr fundrai		3, W3 MS	olyma
main     main     main     main     main     main       27     1601     2-acadylmetryllvane     n.0     MS       27     1601     2-acadylmetryllvane     y-butirolactone     42 + 86     S, MS     Fluka       29     1617     2-acadoxy-1-propanel     0     GC     S, MS     Fluka       21     16161     2-transmethanol     futuryl alcohol     82 + 97     S, MS     Fluka       31     1667     4-hydroxy-2-prelnanic acid y-tactone     angelicalactone     89 + 55     S, MS     Sigma       33     1667     4-hydroxy-2-prelnanic acid y-tactone     angelicalactone     80 + 55     S, MS     Sigma       36     1673     diethyl succinate     0     C     S, MS     Sigma       37     1677     diethyl succinate     C     MS     MS     Main       38     1725     benzyl acatate     MS     Sigma     MS     Main       37     1677     heralactone     caprolacation     100     NS     Main <tr< td=""><td>25</td><td>1594</td><td><math>\delta</math>-valerolactone</td><td></td><td>TIC</td><td>MS</td><td></td></tr<>	25	1594	$\delta$ -valerolactone		TIC	MS	
	26	1597	dibydro-4-methyl-2(3H)-furanone		NO	MS	
1611dhydro-2(3/f)-furanone $\gamma$ -bulirolactone42 + 66S, MSFluka2916172-acetoxy-1-propanol10NMSFluka311654propanetiol diacetate isomer60S, MSFluka3116542-furanmethanolfurfuryl alcohol82 + 97S, MSFluka3316674-hydroxy-3-pertanoic acid y-lactoneangelicalactone89 + 55S, MSAldrich3416703-ethyl-2-hydroxy-2-cyclopenten-1-oneTICMSSigma351673isopentancic acid60S, MSSigma361673diethyl succinateTICMSSigma371687y-hexalactonecaprolactone85S, MSAldrich381725benzyl acetateTICMSSigma391742propanetiol diacetate isomerTICMSSigma411768methyl salcilateTICMSSigma42177414-framethyl-2-duryl-2-propanoneTICMSAldrich431780ethyl 2-phenylacetateTICMSAldrich451791butoxyethoxyethanolgalacicl10+ 124S, MSAldrich4618182-phenylethylacetateTICMSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS451791butoxyethoxyethanolgalacicl10+ 124S, MSAldrich461818 </td <td>27</td> <td>1601</td> <td>2-acetyl-5-methylfurane</td> <td></td> <td>TIC</td> <td>MS</td> <td></td>	27	1601	2-acetyl-5-methylfurane		TIC	MS	
29     1617     2-acetony-f-propand     TC     MS       30     1627     butancic acid     60     S, MS     Fluka       31     1664     propanediol diacetale Isomer     TC     MS       32     1661     2-luranmethanol     furturyl alcohol     82 + 97     S, MS     Fluka       32     1661     2-luranmethanol     anglicitalactone     98 + 55     S, MS     Fluka       34     1670     3-ethyl-2-hydroxy-2-cytolpenten-1-one     isovaleric acid     60     S, MS     Sigma       36     1673     diethyl suconate     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       38     1725     berzyl acetate     TC     MS     4ldrich       39     1742     propanedic lideetate isomer     TC     MS     4ldrich       41     1768     methyl-salupit/p-aropanone     NQ     MS     slight       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-4urylr/p-aropanone     NQ     MS     aldrich       43     1780     ethyl aphenylacotate     TC	28	1611	dihvdro-2(3 <i>H</i> )-furanone	v-butirolactone	42 + 86	S. MS	Fluka
30     1627     butanoic and function of an experimentation of a constraint of a constrain	29	1617	2-acetoxy-1-propanol	,	TIC	MS	
11     1654     propanedial disertate isomer     TC     MS       22     1661     2-lurammethanol     furlury lackone     angelicialactone     82 + 97     S, MS     Aldrich       32     1667     4-hydroxy-3-pentanoic acid y-lactone     angelicialactone     B4 + 55     S, MS     Sigma       34     1670     3-ethyl-2-hydroxy-2-cyclopenten-1-one     TC     MS     Sigma       36     1673     diethyl succinate     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       37     1687     y-hexalactone     caprolactone     TC     MS       38     1725     berzyl acetata     roc     MS     Aldrich       39     1742     propanedici disectata isomer     TC     MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl salicitate     NQ     MS     Aldrich       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-luryl)-2-propanene     TC     MS     Aldrich       43     170     ethyl salocitate     TC     MS     Aldrich       44     1768     S-valerolactone <td>30</td> <td>1627</td> <td>butanoic acid</td> <td></td> <td>60</td> <td>S, MS</td> <td>Fluka</td>	30	1627	butanoic acid		60	S, MS	Fluka
32     1661     2-furanmethand     furthryl alcohol     82 + 97     S, MS     Floka       33     1667     4-hydroxy-3-pentanoic acid y-lactone     angelicalactone     98 + 55     S, MS     Aldrich       34     1673     isopentanoic acid     isovelenc acid     60     S, MS     Sigma       36     1673     isopentanoic acid     isovelenc acid     60     S, MS     Sigma       37     1687     y-hexalactone     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       38     1725     benzyl acetate     methyl salcialte     TIC     MS       40     1748     pentanoic acid     valeric acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl-salcialte     10A     MS     Idixing     Midrich       42     1774     1-fs-methyl-2-furyllyl-2-propanone     TIC     MS     Midrich       43     1760     ethyl-2-phonylacetate     TO     MS     Aldrich       43     1774     1-fs-methyl-2-furyllyl-2-phonal     caproic acid     60 + 73 <td>31</td> <td>1654</td> <td>propanediol diacetate Isomer</td> <td></td> <td>TIC</td> <td>MS</td> <td></td>	31	1654	propanediol diacetate Isomer		TIC	MS	
33     1667     4-hydroxy-3-pertancic acid y-ladone     angelicalactone     88 + 55     S, MS     Aldrich       34     1670     3-ethyl-2-hydroxy-2-cyclopenten-1-one     isovaleric acid     60     S, MS     Sigma       36     1673     identhyl succinate     acaprolactone     85     S, MS     Sigma       37     167     y-hexalactone     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       38     1725     benzyl acetate     TIC     MS       39     1742     propanediol diacetate isomer     TIC     MS       40     1748     pentancic acid     valeric acid     06 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl-2-phenylacetate     TIC     MS     44       176     5-valeridactone     TIC     MS     44       1780     ethyl 2-phenylaethyl acetate     Cyclotene     TIC     MS       44     1786     5-valeridactone     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       45     1710     busyethoxyethane     cap	32	1661	2-furanmethanol	furfuryl alcohol	82 + 97	S, MS	Fluka
34     1670     3-ethyl-2-hydroxy-2-cyclopenten-1-one     TC     MS       35     1673     isopentanolic acid     isopentanolic acid     60     S, MS     Sigma       36     1673     diethyl succinate     101 + 129     S, MS     Sigma       37     1687     y-hexalactone     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       38     1725     benzyl acetate     TC     MS     MS       39     1742     propanediol diacetate isomer     TC     MS     Aldrich       40     1748     pentanoic acid     valeric acid     64 - 73     S, MS     Sigma       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-hydrolycetate     NO     MS     164       43     1780     ethyl 2-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten     TC     MS     164       45     1791     butoxyethoxyethanol     cyclotene     TC     MS     Aldrich       47     1839     2-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-one     cyclotene     TIC     MS     Aldrich       47     1839     2-h	33	1667	4-hydroxy-3-pentanoic acid $\gamma$ -lactone	angelicalactone	98 + 55	S, MS	Aldrich
35     1673     isopertancic acid     isovaleric acid     60     S, MS     Sigma       36     1673     diethyl succinate     101 + 129     S, MS     Sigma       37     1687     y-hexalactone     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       38     1725     benzyl acetate     CG     MS     TC     MS       39     1742     propanetiol diacetate isomer     TC     MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl saliclate     valeric acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Sigma       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-tynly)2-propanone     TC     MS     Maka       43     1780     ethyl 2-phenylacetate     TC     MS     Maka       44     1786     s-valerolactone     TC     MS     Aldrich       45     1716     bursynhoxyethox	34	1670	3-ethyl-2-hydroxy-2-cyclopenten-1-one	-	TIC	MS	
361673diethyl succinate101 + 129S, MSSigma371687 $\gamma$ -hexalactoneacprolactone85S, MSAldrich381742propanediol diacetate isomerTICMS391742propanediol diacetate isomerTICMS391742propanediol diacetate isomerTICMS301743pentanoic acidvaleric acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich411768methyl salicilateIRCNGMS4217741-(5-methyl-2-troyl)-2-propanoneNGMSMS4317665-valerolactoneTICMSMS4417865-valerolactoneTICMSMitha451791butoxyethxonolcycloteneTICMS461870hexanoic acidcaproic acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldifytor_2(3/h)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldifytor_2(3/h)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich521967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldifytor_2(3/h)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich531962trans-4-methyl-5-butyldifytor_2(3/h)-furanonecis-whiskey	35	1673	isopentanoic acid	isovaleric acid	60	S, MS	Sigma
37     1687     y-hexalactone     caprolactone     85     S, MS     Aldrich       38     1725     benzyl acetate     TIC     MS       39     1742     propanetici diacetate isomer     TIC     MS       40     1748     pentanoic acid     valeric acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl salicilate     120     S, MS     MS       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-tyr)yl-2-propanone     NQ     MS       43     1780     ethyl 2-phenylacetate     NQ     MS       44     1786     5-valerolactone     TIC     MS       45     1791     butoxyethoxyethanol     75     S, MS     Aldrich       46     1818     2-phenylethyl-2-cyclopenten-1-one     cyclotene     TIC     MS       47     1830     2-methoxyphenol     guaiacol     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       48     1870     hexanoic acid     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       1890     benzyl alcoho	36	1673	diethyl succinate		101 + 129	S, MS	Sigma
38 1725 benzyl acetate TIC MS   39 1742 propanediol diacetate isomer TIC MS   39 1748 pertanoic acid valeric acid 60 + 73 S, MS Aldrich   41 1768 methyl salicilate 120 S, MS Sigma   42 1774 1-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanone NQ MS   42 1774 1-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanone TIC MS   42 1776 1-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanone TIC MS   43 1786 5-valerolactate TIC MS   44 1786 5-valerolactate TIC MS   45 1791 butoxyethoxyethanol TIC MS   46 1870 hexanoic acid caproic acid 60 + 73 S, MS Aldrich   47 1839 2-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopentern-1-one cyclotene TIC MS   48 1870 hexanoic acid caproic acid 60 + 73 S, MS Aldrich   49 1875 2-methoxyphenol guiacol 109 + 124 S, MS Aldrich   51 1898 trans-4-methyl-5-bulydidhydro-2(3/f)-furanone trans-whiskeylactone 99<	37	1687	$\gamma$ -hexalactone	caprolactone	85	S, MS	Aldrich
39     1742     propanediol diacetate isomer     TIC     MS       40     1748     pentanoic acid     valeric acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl salicilate     120     S, MS     Sigma       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanone     NQ     MS       43     1780     ethyl 2-phenylacetate     TIC     MS       43     1786     s-valerolacotone     TIC     MS       44     1786     2-valerolacotone     TIC     MS       45     1791     butoxyethoxyethanol     75     S, MS     Aldrich       46     1818     2-phenylethyl acetate     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       47     1870     hexanoic acid     caproic acid     109 + 124     S, MS     Aldrich       48     1870     hexanoic acid     guaacol     109 + 124     S, MS     Aldrich       51     1898     benzyl achohl     penzyl achohl     TIC     MS     Sigma       52	38	1725	benzyl acetate		TIC	MS	
40     1748     pertanoic acid     valeric acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       41     1768     methyl salicilate     120     S, MS     Sigma       42     1774     1-(5-methyl-2-truyl)-2-propanone     NQ     MS       43     1780     ethyl 2-phenylacetate     164     S, MS     fluka       44     1786     5-valerolactone     TC     MS     MS       45     1791     butoxyethoxyethanol     Caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       46     1818     2-phenylethyl acetate     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       47     1839     2-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-one     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       47     1839     tharanoic acid     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       470     1838     trans-4-methyl-5-butylihylror-2(3H)-furanone     trans-whiskeylactone     99     S, MS     Aldrich       51     1996     1.4-butanediol diacetate     cis-whiskeylactone     99     S,	39	1742	propanediol diacetate isomer		TIC	MS	
411768methyl salicilate120S, MSSigma4217741-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanoneNQMS431780ethyl 2-phenylaetateIG4S, MSfluka4417865-valerolactoneTICMS451791butoxyethoxyethanol75S, MSAldrich4618182-phenylethyl acetateIO4S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolguaiacol109 + 124S, MSAldrich501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholTICMSTICMS5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMSTICMS5319252-phenylethynan-4onematol126S, MSFluka541976trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonematol126S, MSAldrich5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4-Hypran-4-onematol126S, MSAldrich59 </td <td>40</td> <td>1748</td> <td>pentanoic acid</td> <td>valeric acid</td> <td>60 + 73</td> <td>S, MS</td> <td>Aldrich</td>	40	1748	pentanoic acid	valeric acid	60 + 73	S, MS	Aldrich
4217741-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanoneNQMS431780ethyl 2-phenylacetate164S, MSfluka4317865-valerolactoneTICMS4417865-valerolactoneTICMS451791butoxyethoxyethanol75S, MSAldrich4618182-phenylethyl acetate104S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolguaiacol109 + 124S, MSSigma501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-winkseylactone99S, MSAldrich5119931,4-butanediol diacetateTICMSTicMS5319252-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-turyldehydeTICMSTicMS551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4-typran4-onemalol126S, MSAldrich5920274-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone17CMS5920274-methyl-2-tydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyatheno	41	1768	methyl salicilate		120	S, MS	Sigma
431780ethyl 2-phenylacetate164S, MSthika4417865-valerolactoneTICMS4417865-valerolactoneTICMS451791butoxyethoxyethoxyethanol75S, MSAldrich4618182-phenylethyl acetate104S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-oclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolgualacol109 + 124S, MSAldrich501898 <i>trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone</i> 99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholmethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS5219031.4-butanediol diacetateTICMS5319252-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS551967 <i>trans-4-methyl-4-pyran-4-one</i> maltol126S, MSAldrich5820191-2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxmethyl keneTICMS5920274-methyl-5-fo-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6120441-hydroxy-3-hydroxy-4-dimethyl-2(3H)-furanonep-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051 <t< td=""><td>42</td><td>1774</td><td>1-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanone</td><td></td><td>NQ</td><td>MS</td><td></td></t<>	42	1774	1-(5-methyl-2-furyl)-2-propanone		NQ	MS	
4417865-valerolactoneTICMS451791butoxyethoxyethanol75S, MSAldrich4618182-phenylethyl acetate104S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid60 + 73S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolguaicol109 + 124S, MSSigma501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholTICMS116MS5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMS1185319252-phenylethyle-furaldehydeTICMS1145419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS114551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemattol126S, MSAldrich5719662,5-furandicarboxatdehydeTICMS1145820191-(-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5-6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6120441H-pyrrole-2-carboxatdehydep-ethylguaicol137 + 152S, MSSjma622051dihydr	43	1780	ethyl 2-phenylacetate		164	S, MS	fluka
451791butoxyethoxyethoxyethonol75S, MSAldrich4618182-phenylethyl acetate104S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid $60 + 73$ S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolguaiacol $109 + 124$ S, MSSigma501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3/h)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholrans-4-methyl-2-furaldehydeTICMSS5319252-phenylethanlphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMSSSAldrich551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3/h)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4/H-pyran-4-onemattol126S, MSAldrich5820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefulydroxymethyl ketoneTICMSS6120474-methyl-5-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMSS622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl-2(3/h)-furanonep-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622054dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl-2(3/h)-furanonep-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma6320613-acetoxy	44	1786	5-valerolactone			MS	
4618182-phenylethyl acetate104S, MSAldrich4718392-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-onecycloteneTICMS481870hexanoic acidcaproic acid $60 + 73$ S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolguaiacol $109 + 124$ S, MSAldrich501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholtrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMST5319252-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMST551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMST5820191-(2-furantyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxylhenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanoneallyl acetateTICMS6320613-acetoxyrpopeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malateSelfor	45	1791	butoxyethoxyethanol		75	S, MS	Aldrich
47     1839     2-hydroxy-3-metnyl-2-cyclopenten-1-one     cyclotene     11C     MS       48     1870     hexanoic acid     caproic acid     60 + 73     S, MS     Aldrich       49     1875     2-methoxyphenol     gualacol     109 + 124     S, MS     Aldrich       50     1898     trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanone     trans-whiskeylactone     99     S, MS     Aldrich       52     1903     1,4-butanediol diacetate     TIC     MS       53     1925     2-phenylethanol     phenylethyl alcohol     91 + 122     S, MS     Fluka       54     1948     5-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehyde     TIC     MS     14/2       55     1967     trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanone     cis-whiskeylactone     99     S, MS     Aldrich       57     1968     2,5-furandicarboxaldehyde     TIC     MS     14/2       58     2019     1-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanone     furylhydroxyethanone     TIC     MS       61     2044     1H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehyde     TIC     MS	46	1818	2-phenylethyl acetate		104	S, MS	Aldrich
481870nexanoic acidcaproic acid604 $r/3$ S, MSAldrich4918752-methoxyphenolguaiacol109 + 124S, MSSigma501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholrans-whiskeylactone99 + 108S, MSAldrich5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMSFluka5319252-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-14/+pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS5920274-methyl-5.6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepathalactoneTICMS6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malatesoleroneTICMS6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoia caidsolerone </td <td>47</td> <td>1839</td> <td>2-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-one</td> <td>cyclotene</td> <td></td> <td>MS</td> <td>AL-L-1-L</td>	47	1839	2-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-cyclopenten-1-one	cyclotene		MS	AL-L-1-L
4918752-Internoxyphenolgualacol109 + 1245, MSSigma501898trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonetrans-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcoholrans-whiskeylactone99 + 108S, MSAldrich5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMS5319252-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSAldrich5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS565820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS6020441H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS516120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl-2(3H)-furanonepantalactoneTICMS51642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydhydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acidsoleroneTICMS6620825-ethoxydhydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS <t< td=""><td>48</td><td>1870</td><td></td><td></td><td>60 + 73</td><td>5, M5</td><td>Aldrich</td></t<>	48	1870			60 + 73	5, M5	Aldrich
501896Indust-infering-outgranding to 2(3h)-fut anotheIndusts with skey lactorie99S, MSAldrich511899benzyl alcohol $79 + 108$ S, MSAldrich5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMS5319252-ptenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS1465820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6020441H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS1416120474-ethyl-2-methoxyhenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl-2(3H)-furanonepantalactoneTICMS141632064diehyl malate117S, MSSigma642064diehyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 733S, MSSigma672103 <td>49</td> <td>1000</td> <td>2-methoxyphenol</td> <td>gualacol</td> <td>109 + 124</td> <td>5, M5</td> <td>Sigma</td>	49	1000	2-methoxyphenol	gualacol	109 + 124	5, M5	Sigma
S11999beltyl actolition79 + 108S, MSAldrich5219031,4-butanediol diacetateTICMS5319252-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS1405820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5.6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6020441H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepathalactoneTICMS642064diethyl malateTICMS117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS117S, MSSigma662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6671031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTicMSTicMSTicMS	50	1090	henry elected	trans-whiskeyiactone	99 70 + 109	5, 1VI5	Aldrich
3219051,4-butaletable diabetablenicenicenice5319052-phenylethanolphenylethyl alcohol91 + 122S, MSFluka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS15820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6020441H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS16120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactoneTICMS1632064diethyl malateI17S, MSSigma642064diethyl malatesoleroneTICMS16520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneG0 + 73S, MSSigma662092octanoic acidtriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenoltriacetinTICMS1	50	1099	1.4 butenedial disectate		79 + 100	3, IVI3	Alunch
3.3192.32-preriver lationpreriver lation91 + 1223, MSHuka5419485-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehydeTICMS551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3H)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS5820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS566020441H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydep-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl-2(3H)-furanonepantalactoneTICMS632064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma642064diethyl malatesoleroneTICMS6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acidsolerone60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTicMSTicMS	52	1905	2 phonylethanol	phonylathyl alcohol	01 + 122		Eluko
5419483-etholymethyl-2-haldelinderrickMis551967trans-4-methyl-5-butyldihydro-2(3/h)-furanonecis-whiskeylactone99S, MSFluka5619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4/H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS5820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS596020441/H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehyderickMS5659S, MSSigma6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetate117S, MSSigma642064diethyl malatesoleroneTICMS6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acidsoleroneTICMS6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSSoleroneTICMS	50	10/0	5 otherwinethyl 2 furaldehyde		91 + 122 TIC	3, 103 MS	riuna
531307Halls-4-Interlyt-9-dutydningtro-2(3) /Fridationecitis winskeyladone535455555619753-hydroxy-2-methyl-4/H-pyran-4-onemaltol126S, MSAldrich5719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS5820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6020441/H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSTICMS	55	1940	trans_1_methyl_5_butyldibydro_2/3/1_furanone	cie-whickeylactone	00	S MS	Fluka
301973314 (1774) (179) (114-01)114101203, MS140105719962,5-furandicarboxaldehydeTICMS5820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS60204411/-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSTICMS	56	1075	3-bydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-ope	maltol	126	S, MS	Aldrich
5710002,0 fundationation you110011005820191-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanonefurylhydroxymethyl ketoneTICMS5920274-methyl-5,6-dihydropyran-2-onedehydromevalonic lactoneTICMS6020441 <i>H</i> -pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenol <i>p</i> -ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3 <i>H</i> )-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3 <i>H</i> )-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSTICMS	57	1006	2 5-furandicarboxaldebyde	mator	TIC	MS	Alunion
SolutionThe full and information of the infor	58	2019	1-(2-furanyl)-2-hydroxyethanone	fundhydroxymethyl ketone	TIC	MS	
6020441H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehydeTICMS6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenolp-ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSSigma	59	2027	4-methyl-5.6-dihydronyran-2-one	dehydromevalonic lactone	TIC	MS	
6120474-ethyl-2-methoxyphenol <i>p</i> -ethylguaiacol137 + 152S, MSSigma622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSSigma	60	2044	1 <i>H</i> -pyrrole-2-carboxaldehyde		TIC	MS	
622051dihydro-3-hydroxy-4,4-dimethyl- 2(3H)-furanonepantalactone71S, MSFluka6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSSigma	61	2047	4-ethyl-2-methoxyphenol	p-ethylouaiacol	137 + 152	S. MS	Sigma
6320613-acetoxypropeneallyl acetateTICMS642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMSSigma	62	2051	dihydro-3-hydroxy-4.4-dimethyl- 2(3 <i>H</i> )-furanone	pantalactone	71	S. MS	Fluka
642064diethyl malate117S, MSSigma6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3H)-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMS	63	2061	3-acetoxypropene	allyl acetate	TIC	MS	
6520825-ethoxydihydro-2(3 <i>H</i> )-furanonesoleroneTICMS662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMS	64	2064	diethvl malate		117	S. MS	Siama
662092octanoic acid60 + 73S, MSSigma6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMS	65	2082	5-ethoxydihydro-2(3 <i>H</i> )-furanone	solerone	TIC	MS	e.gina
6721031,2,3-propanetriyl triacetatetriacetin43S, MSAldrich6821104-methylphenolTICMS	66	2092	octanoic acid	···· •	60 + 73	S, MS	Siama
68 2110 4-methylphenol TIC MS	67	2103	1,2,3-propanetriyl triacetate	triacetin	43	S, MS	Aldrich
	68	2110	4-methylphenol		TIC	MS	

#### Table 2. Continued

number	RI <sup>a</sup>	compound	other name	quantification <sup>b</sup>	identification <sup>c</sup>	supplier <sup>d</sup>
69	2185	2-methoxy-4-(2-propenyl)phenol	eugenol	164	S, MS	Sigma
70	2198	4-ethylphenol		107 + 122	S, MS	Sigma
71	2215	5-acetoxymethyl-2-carboxaldehyde	acetoxymethyl furfural	126	S, MS	Aldrich
72	2244	1,2,3-propanetriol diacetate		TIC	MS	
73	2271	1,2,3-propanetriol monoacetate		TIC	MS	
74	2272	2,6-dimethoxyphenol	siringol	139 + 154	S, MS	Fluka
75	2275	2,3-dihydro-3,5-dihydroxy-6-methyl-4H-pyran-4-one	ddmp	TIC	MS	
76	2283	decanoic acid		60 + 73	S, MS	Sigma
77	2295	3,5-dihydroxy-2-methyl-4H-pyran-4-one	5-hydroxymaltol	TIC	MS	
78	2328	4-(1-hydroxyethyl) $\gamma$ -butanolactone		NQ	MS	
79	2404	ethyl hydrogensuccinate		101	S, MS	Sigma
80	2455	benzoic acid		105 + 122	S, MS	Sigma
81	2467	2-furancarboxylic acid	2-furoic acid	95 + 112	S, MS	Sigma
82	2509	5-hydroxymethyl-2-carboxaldehyde	HMF	97 + 126	S, MS	Sigma
83	2519	5-acetyl-2-furanmethanol		NQ	MS	
84	2567	4-hydroxy-3-methoxybenzaldehyde	vanillin	151 + 152	S, MS	Sigma
85	2574	phenylacetic acid		91 + 136	S, MS	Aldrich
86	2658	4-hydroxy-3-methoxybenzoic acid ethyl ester	ethyl vanillate	196	S, MS	Aldrich
87	2667	1-(4-hydroxy-3-methoxyphenyl)ethanone	acetovanillone	151	S, MS	Aldrich
88	2722	tetradecanoic acid		TIC	MS	
89	2786	4-hydroxy-3-methoxyphenethanol	homovanillyl alcohol	TIC	MS	
90	2827	hexadecanoic acid		73 + 129	S, MS	Sigma
91	2854	4-hydroxy-3,5-dimethoxybenzaldehyde	siringaldehyde	181 + 182	S, MS	Aldrich
92	2864	4-hydroxybenzaldehyde		TIC	MS	
93	2925	4-hydroxyphenyl ethanol	tyrosol	107	S, MS	Sigma

<sup>a</sup> Retention index. <sup>b</sup> Mass fragments used for quantification purposes (TIC denotes the use of the peak area as acquired in the TIC mode; NQ stands for not quantified). <sup>c</sup> Identification obtained by means of standard compounds (S) and/or mass spectra (MS). <sup>d</sup> Supplier of the standard compound.

and their amount was compared between samples, also taking into account the starting material and the production process specific for each vinegar.

Overall, the amounts of alcohols found in our samples were substantially in accordance with other works on TBV (7, 8), BVM (8, 9), and JVs (8, 10-12) (**Table 3**).

If compared to BVM and JVs, a general lower amount of these compounds could be seen in TBVM, likely because of the almost absent alcoholic fermentation during the production phases of this latter. This is particularly evident for 3-methyl-1-butanol and, to a lesser extent, for 2-phenyl ethanol and tyrosol, which typically derive from amino acid metabolism of yeast cells during alcoholic fermentation (*14*). As already found by Zeppa et al. (7), furthermore, 3-methyl-1-butanol decreases as the aging phase progresses, being the highest in BVM (where the mean aging period is shorter) and the lowest in both the JVs commercial classes. A similar trend was shown for benzyl and homovanillyl alcohols, which were lower in TBVM than in BVM and JVs.

Aldehydes may derive from alcohol oxidation or wood leakage. Significant differences between vinegars were found for benzaldehyde, syringaldehyde, and vanillin, with the latter being the highest in long wood aged TBVM and JVs. Similar amounts of vanillin were found by Callejón et al. (9), who did not consider TBVM in their work. Quite surprisingly, Zeppa et al. (7) did not find vanillin or syringaldehyde in three different batteries of TBVRE, maybe because of the extraction method employed by these authors, which used a different type of cartridge (C18 instead of LiChrolut-EN) and an higher volume of washing water (30 mL) before the elution of volatile compounds.

In vinegars, acids mainly come from alcohol oxidation acted by acetic bacteria. Their presence, hence, is expected to be somehow related to the amount of alcohols in the raw material. On the basis of our data, acids were significantly higher in VJ and VR, while both the TBVM and BVM had the lowest concentration. This finding is particularly evident for short-chain acids (C3–C6),

which were statistically the highest in VR (may be because of the longer acetification process with respect to VJ).

Excluding the nonstudied acetic acid, isovaleric acid represents by far the main acid in vinegars (up to about 80% of the total in JVs), and its concentration in VJ and VR is slightly higher than that reported by Durán Guerrero et al. (12) or other authors (9, 10). In BVM and TBVM, however, our data largely agree with Callejón et al. (9) and Zeppa et al. (7), respectively.

Acetates are formed by esterification between acetic acid and mono- or polyalcohols and are expected to increase according to aging duration (7). However, only slight differences were found between vinegars in the sum of acetates (Table 3). On the contrary, taking into account each single ester, it can be noticed that VR had the highest amount of propanediol and benzyl acetates, while TBVM contained the highest quantities of butanediol diacetate and triacetin. The latter appeared to be characteristic of TBVM, and its amount discriminated the "younger" TBVM "affinato" from the "older" TBVM "extravecchio". Quantitatively, similar amounts of benzyl and 2-phenylethyl acetates were reported by Natera Marín et al. (11), Durán Guerrero et al. (12), and Callejón et al. (9), in JVs and BVM, respectively. Acetates coming from di- or triols were only reported by Zeppa et al. (7) in TBVM, at lower concentration ranges.

Ethylic esters are another family of compounds already reported in vinegars. Their amount has been significantly correlated with the ethanol content of the raw material (10).

As a sum, in fact, vinegars coming from an alcoholic matrix (BVM, VJ, and VR) had the highest ethyl ester amounts, while both of the TBVMs (affinato and extravecchio) had the lowest. A major part of this difference is due to ethyl hydrogen succinate, which is the main ethyl ester in all of the vinegars. However, significant differences between TBVM and all of the other vinegars were also found for ethyl lactate, diethyl succinate, methyl salicilate, and ethyl-2-phenylacetate. The latter seems to

Table 3.	Concentrations	$(\mu q/kq)$	of Different	Groups of	Volatile Com	pounds in	European	Protected I	Denomination	Vinegar S	Samples
		V 3 3/									

	TBV affinato TBV extravecchio BVM					VJ						VR								
compound	median	min	max		median	min	max		median	min	max		median	min	max		median	min	max	
							Alc	cohol	s											
1-butanol		nd	nd			nd	nd		loa	nd	7.45		loa	nd	1.39		loa	nd	10.65	
3-methyl-1-butanol (mg/kg)	0.53	0.02	16.6	а	0.10	0.00	0.79	а	56.21	25.61	77.46	с	27.01	15.62	37.08	b	25.83	14.73	48.44	b
3-ethoxy-1-propanol	68.5	55.4	391		103	26.4	438		242	141	1084		239	177	307		276	163	1600	
2-acetoxy-1-propanol <sup>b</sup>	30.8	17.6	83.6		53.8	47.7	148		38.6	16.1	59.7		31.4	23.5	39.2		42.2	40.3	86.8	
butoxyethoxyethanol	141	72.4	276	b	120	18.8	373	b	29.1	22.1	47.3	а	25.9	21.1	46.5	а	41.3	20.0	93.0	ab
benzyl alcohol	177	81.6	292	а	342	231	510	а	576	443	1106	b	656	524	849	b	1079	848	1532	С
2-phenylethanol (mg/kg)	8.65	3.55	9.89	а	14.12	8.14	35.3	ab	18.2	13.3	28.7	ab	17.9	14.3	21.2	ab	21.8	15.9	29.8	b
homovanillyl alcohol <sup>c</sup>	75.9	41.4	80.6	а	87.4	84.2	110	а	138	90.2	232	ab	345	286	486	b	253	112	830	b
tyrosol (mg/kg)	8.17	5.71	16.9	а	18.0	12.0	32.9	а	11.6	7.19	27.1	ab	45.2	25.0	54.7	b	30.2	12.2	85.2	b
sum alcohols (mg/kg)	18.4	13.2	26.0	а	30.8	23.7	70.2	а	88.1	48.1	132	b	90.6	65.3	107	b	90.8	44.0	145	b
							Alde	ehyd	es											
benzaldehyde	9.47	4.82	11.2	а	8.87	4.86	15.3	а	15.8	9.77	23.4	а	61.2	17.5	110	ab	71.5	63.4	198	b
vanillin	967	399	1161	b	1476	1248	4810	b	192	43.0	625	а	1039	700	3317	b	1537	1165	2821	b
siringaldehyde	887	233	1982	ab	1568	1440	6313	ab	185	nd	792	а	3133	2984	8849	b	3409	1585	6684	b
4-hydroxybenzaldehyde <sup>d</sup>	45.1	20.9	80.5		82.7	54.2	119		18.5	9.88	32.3		55.8	48.1	292		89.4	64.2	226	
sum aldehydes (mg/kg)	1.94	0.70	3.05	ab	3.13	2.82	11.2	b	0.42	0.06	1.44	а	4.25	3.83	12.6	b	5.23	3.03	9.80	b
							A	cids												
propanoic acid	502	128	837	а	397	309	636	а	2143	1283	4107	b	3164	2028	4296	bc	4573	3425	6337	С
isobutyric acid <sup>e</sup>	600	272	1606	а	737	638	1748	а	1358	816	2442	а	2775	2243	3105	b	3749	3560	4775	С
butyric acid	196	67.2	353	а	200	129	489	а	724	535	2372	а	1400	1264	4263	ab	3459	1593	8069	С
isovaleric acid (mg/kg)	8.42	0.98	35.5	а	16.0	4.01	24.9	а	17.4	11.0	36.7	а	110	75.2	154	b	151	139	218	С
pentanoic acid	24.7	4.50	54.3	а	31.5	26.1	77.0	а	74.4	44.6	142	а	132	115	161	ab	367	188	1156	b
hexanoic acid	350	117	990	а	561	307	988	а	1522	862	2452	b	2336	1871	2768	b	3255	2766	3966	С
octanoic acid	63.1	loq	382	а	210	101	1197	а	1325	518	2434	b	1748	1258	2745	b	2065	1577	2420	b
decanoic acid	loq	loq	10.3	а	10.7	loq	136	а	79.3	7.26	129	а	156	56.7	409	ab	165	97.4	386	b
tetradecanoic acid <sup>f</sup>	52.6	6.48	77.9		67.0	51.6	265		58.4	15.1	133		127	86.0	217		98.4	30.6	166	
hexadecanoic acid	395	85.9	669		547	286	1497		492	227	922		1835	871	10886		715	173	1890	
phenylacetic acid	2506	955	2713	ab	3537	2795	5332	ab	913	583	2999	а	3897	3172	8627	bc	6381	3607	8733	С
benzoic acid	1757	479	3646	а	4673	1650	5411	а	476	246	1183	а	3311	2376	11795	ab	8804	5530	13642	b
sum acids (mg/kg)	15.4	8.13	44.2	а	30.5	13.6	33.4	а	27.7	16.3	52.3	а	134	94.3	192	b	195	168	260	b
							Ac	etate	S											
hexyl acetate	6.87	loq	33.65		2.25	loq	25.12		16.01	9.21	109.94		25.97	12.35	76.38		50.37	19.34	75.13	
butanediol diacetate isomer <sup>g</sup>	loq	loq	36.6		2.73	nd	69.5		nd	nd	nd		nd	nd	nd		nd	nd	3.55	
butanediol diacetate isomer <sup>g</sup>	loq	loq	72.5		22.7	4.16	149		nd	nd	nd		nd	nd	nd		8.38	loq	31.6	
1,2-etanediol diacetate	loq	loq	5.75		loq	nd	33.5		nd	nd	nd		nd	nd	nd		nd	nd	nd	
propanediol diacetate isomer <sup>g</sup>	76.6	30.6	368	а	341	229	458	а	574	103	799	а	368	243	431	а	995	582	1589	b
benzyl acetate	6.86	loq	16.3	а	11.7	8.94	31.4	а	18.9	6.63	29.5	а	22.5	16.3	28.7	а	59.3	46.3	68.8	b
propanediol diacetate isomer <sup>g</sup>	349	158	1673	а	811	462	1160	а	3291	1139	4766	b	2033	1761	2270	ab	3232	2349	6335	b
2-phenylethyl acetate	693	279	2189		1599	746	4999		1812	1169	2241		1642	1123	1892		2364	2111	5086	
1,4-butanediol diacetate <sup>9</sup>	40.6	30.8	67.0	ab	136	111	231	b	31.3	11.1	80.4	а	29.4	19.0	67.6	a	62.4	32.3	87.6	a
allyl acetate	27.8	9.21	63.1	ab	63.2	61.2	187	b	loq	nd	19.1	а	3.93	loq	12.7	ab	18.2	2.49	61.9	ab
triacetin	15.2	loq	84.8	b	112	/9.4	351	С	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а	loq	nd	0.03	а
1,2,3-propanetriol diacetate <sup>9</sup>	670	485	1891		2465	1232	4867		681	282	12/3		882	733	1155		1323	1040	2264	
1,2,3-propanetriol monoacetate <sup>9</sup>	43.1	19.2	169		240	97.2	519		37.5	loq	11/		65.8	48.6	88.8		113	/5.3	203	
sum acetates (mg/kg)	2.61	1.14	4.83	а	5.97	3.38	12.3	ab	6.82	3.62	6.99	ab	5.08	4.47	5.49	ab	8.14	6.79	13.42	b
			10.0				. E	sters									0.45			
ethyl hexanoate	loq	nd	18.2		nd	nd	loq		nd	nd	nd		loq	loq	6.35		6.43	loq	20.7	
etnyl lactate	126	loq	366	а	10.0	1.86	379	а	3209	/70	11925	b	1698	979	19427	b	3681	427	8166	b
ethyl 3-hydroxybutirate	51.9	10.2	368		168	113	661		99.4	89.1	145		147	65.9	168		188	138	283	
alethyl succinate	loq	loq	21.4	а	nd	nd	loq	а	635	100	1915	b	823	181	1366	b	194	61.6	689	ab
etnyl 2-phenylacetate	2.09	loq	24.0	а	loq	loq	29.2	а	3.82	loq	34.4	a	88.3	63.5	236	b	207	108	368	b
methyl salicilate	5.02	1.34	15.7	а	5.06	1.41	30.5	а	20.4	14.3	67.2	ab	32.8	19.6	3/.7	ab	5/./	27.8	/6.8	b
aletnyl malate	nd	nd	nd		loq	lod	249		nd	nd	nd		pol	pol	/8.5	Ŀ	nd	nd	nd	,
etriyi nyarogensuccinate (mg/kg)	0.14	lod	b.94	а	lod 07.0	poi	18.6	а	85./	42.5	193	D	145	bU.U	182	Ø	99.0	16.1	131	D
	16.5	3.57	28.8	-	37.2	19.9	119	-	56.0	1.39	130	L.	11/	96.4	14/	k	96.6	47.0	228	L
sum esters (mg/kg)	0.71	0.04	7.02	a	0.33	0.15	20.0	a	90.8	50.9	199	a	15/	00.0	185	D	103	10	140	D

## Table 3. Continued

	TB	V affina	ato	o TBV extravecchio BVM				VJ		VR										
compound	median	min	max		median	min	max		median	min	max		median	min	max		median	min	max	
							Enolic [	Deriv	atives											
3-ethvl-2-hvdroxv-2-cvclopenten-1-one <sup>h</sup>	21.6	15.3	97.3	ab	42.3	21.1	126	b	6.7	nd	9.6	а	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а
cyclotene <sup>h</sup>	198	100	269	bc	300	249	457	С	181	log	514	b	log	log	76.9	а	6.86	log	36.5	а
maltol	462	317	611	ab	1003	791	1417	b	111	73.8	275	а	83.9	45.4	123	а	178	99.1	311	а
5-hydroxymaltol <sup>h</sup>	585	174	1989		1003	743	2654		360	169	1533		96.6	20.9	1025		234	175	2050	
sum enolic derivatives (mg/kg)	1.36	0.69	2.72	ab	2.55	2.19	3.85	b	0.61	0.25	1.96	а	0.18	0.07	1.22	а	0.40	0.31	2.35	а
					F	- uranic	and P	yrani	ic Derivati	ives										
5-methyl-2-furaldehyde	4436	2499	5224	bc	3894	2150	6664	с	1229	716	3081	ab	loq	loq	962	а	51.6	loq	487	а
furfural (mg/kg)	75.2	40.0	76.7	b	54.3	38.5	90.2	b	9.12	2.74	41.7	а	1.82	1.38	5.88	а	5.12	3.66	21.6	а
2-acetylfuran	802	396	1790	ab	767	428	2422	b	631	238	842	ab	60.1	13.4	254	а	164	110	519	а
2-acetyl-5-methylfurane <sup>i</sup>	loq	loq	1092		33.8	12.1	246		loq	nd	13.1		nd	nd	nd		nd	nd	3.38	
2-furanmethanol	118	94.4	149	ab	147	122	248	ab	264	90.8	713	b	44.3	7.78	88.2	а	1.65	1.65	198	а
5-ethoxymethyl-2-furaldehyde <sup>i</sup>	loq	nd	122	ab	153	loq	2647	b	loq	loq	165	а	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а
2,5-furandicarboxaldehyde <sup>i</sup>	1778	680	2439	С	1934	1404	3586	С	227	153	680	b	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а
furylhydroxymethyl ketone <sup>i</sup>	2544	loq	6362	ab	4178	2406	9504	b	1888	loq	7985	ab	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а
1 H-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehyde <sup>i</sup>	283	155	518	b	433	180	567	b	351	216	555	b	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а
5-acetoxymethyl-2-furaldehyde (mg/kg)	89.6	54.8	97.4	b	215	103	271	b	loq	nd	9.29	а	nd	nd	nd	а	nd	nd	nd	а
ddmp <sup>h</sup>	273	125	292	b	298	131	331	b	392	259	1052	b	10.5	10.5	43.2	а	10.5	10.5	39.1	а
2-furancarboxylic acid	1167	901	2339	ab	3854	2889	4679	b	858	262	2328	а	1504	1228	2154	ab	2112	1766	2907	ab
5-hydroxymethyl-2-furaldehyde (mg/kg)	1614	728	2308	b	2055	1456	2782	b	646	427	931	ab	11.5	4.46	51.8	а	12.9	0.69	46.3	а
sum furanic compounds (mg/kg)	1773	886	2466	с	2388	1689	3117	С	659	430	1001	b	15.1	7.51	60.2	а	19.9	6.86	70.9	а
							Ke	tone	S											
acetovanillone	102	63	173		267	161	431		124	107	157		263	247	607		336	180	765	
3-hydroxy-3-methyl-2-butanone	19.8	10.3	28.0		18.0	12.0	32.2		38.3	19.6	186		30.8	25.0	91.1		75.3	26.6	270	
3-hvdroxy-2-butanone (acetoin)	322	loa	1702	а	102	loa	623	а	5960	1786	14997	b	6992	1789	11042	b	5039	2399	9654	b
4-hydrohy-4-methyl-2-pentanone	241	38	522		217	196	304		198	66	335		181	167	249		244	130	527	
sum ketones (mg/kg)	0.77	0.43	2.06	а	0.66	0.59	1.25	а	6.42	1.98	15.6	b	7.66	2.32	11.5	b	6.150	2.972	10.00	b
							Lao	ctone	es											
5-valerolactone <sup>k</sup>	43.7	34.4	61.7	ab	70.2	41.5	99.3	b	23.0	16.9	34.7	а	18.4	13.8	32.7	а	33.3	18.5	76.7	ab
caprolactone	14.9	4 72	33.0	h	54.8	29.2	172	ĉ	14.9	loa	26.6	a	18.1	7 4 1	31.6	ĥ	64 1	30.6	99.3	c
trans-whiskevlactone			7 12	a	2 23	loa	428	a	1 22	log	12.6	a	139	124	167	h	115	22.6	157	h
<i>cis</i> -whiskeylactone	17.0	7 04	43.0	ah	46.7	35.1	551	h	1.22	log	0.1	a	22.3	6.88	26.5	ab	27.2	loa	33.5	ah
dehydromevalonic lactone <sup>k</sup>	412	291	1033	ab	1588	1356	3406	b	181	97.8	367	a	193	109	382	a	470	320	828	a
pantalactone	1461	420	1911	ub	2569	2454	2895	5	1189	637	2433	u	592	397	1418	u	1122	740	2297	u
solerone <sup>k</sup>	234	105	286	ah	403	305	622	h	101	80.6	178	а	97 7	65.0	155	а	122	91.0	171	а
$\delta$ -valerolactone <sup>k</sup>	127	85.5	257	ub	268	168	711	D	63.4	45.4	463	u	62.8	60.6	76 1	u	107	79.4	234	u
v-butirolactone	713	422	858		1368	946	2325		1086	569	2043		666	269	713		616	462	1188	
angelicalactone <sup>k</sup>	567	301	635	hc	02/	702	1377	c	612	80.2	1100	hc	160	64.3	121	ah	60 1	40L	107	2
sum lactones (mg/kg)	4.50	2.91	5.22	a	8.35	7.67	12.8	b	4.49	3.13	7.27	a	100	04.0	3.37	3.18	4.04	4.29	6.50	a
oum activitios (mg/ng)	1.00	2.01	0.22	u	0.00	1.01	Ph	enol	s	0.10	7.27	u			0.07	0.10	1.01	1.20	0.00	u
siringol	22.5	10.5	26.5		25.7	2/1 8	30 /		24.6	22 G	27.6		20.0	18.3	21.5		18.8	18.0	24.7	
ausiacol	61	30	65		6.8	24.0 57	12 /12		7 50	4 86	9.85		6.37	5 /17	0.38		9.8/	6.31	1 <u>4</u> 1	
n-ethylausiacol	0.1 8 3 1	0.2	0.J 22 Q	2	8 02	J.1 3,20	27 1	2	02.6	00 ג חג	137	h	1/0	J.+/ 75 0	0.00 007	h	1/1	105	176	h
A-methylphenol <sup>/</sup>	12.0	104 8 55	1/6	a	0.90	0.02 15 1	386	a	5 52	5 02	79/	U	120	1 J.Z	201 21 0	U	1/1 5	11 7	82.0	U
	5.02	0.00	0 1 9		21.0 2 00	1J.1 0/11	00.0 00 E		0.00	1 1 1	1.04 2.70		6 10	ייי. קדר ג	∠1.0 7.00		630	5 17	7/0	
	0.02 47 1	2.0/ 20 0	0.13 Q0 7	~	0.09	2.41 57 /	20.0 200 0	~h	2.0/ 100	1.44	0.70 202	h	0.49 007	0.// 1/0	1.22	h	100	1/0	7.4U 240	h
	47.1 10E	00.9 00.9	160	a	160	07.4 107	∠00.3	aD	190	110	200 450	U ch	201	143 266	249 540	D h	199	14Z	∠49 471	U h
Sum prienois	CUI	o∠.3	100	a	102	121	320	aD	J2 I	011	402	aD	430	200	542	U	401	010	4/1	U
			_				ler	pene	es											
linalool oxide isomer 1	5.35	loq	7.49	а	7.20	loq	21.0	а	35.1	12.7	50.3	b	12.8	10.9	18.9	а	28.3	25.1	40.5	ab
linalool oxide isomer 2	4.90	loq	8.60	а	5.98	1.89	9.54	а	18.1	6.45	23.4	b	7.56	5.09	9.30	а	19.1	14.3	22.3	b
sum terpenes	10.01	loq	17.21	а	13.18	2.01	30.5	а	55.3	19.2	73.7	b	20.4	16.2	28.3	а	47.4	39.4	62.9	b

<sup>*a*</sup> In the same row, different letters indicate significant difference (*p* < 0.01). Median, median value; min, minimun value; max, maximum value; nd, below the detection limit; loq, below the quantification limit. Flagged compounds are expressed as follows. <sup>*b*</sup> 3-Ethoxy-1-propanol. <sup>*c*</sup> Vanillin. <sup>*d*</sup> Benzaldehyde. <sup>*e*</sup> Butyric acid. <sup>*f*</sup> Decanoic acid. <sup>*g*</sup> Triacetin. <sup>*h*</sup> Maltol. <sup>*i*</sup> 2-Acetyl furan. <sup>*j*</sup> Furoic acid. <sup>*k*</sup> *y*-Butyrolactone. <sup>*l*</sup> Guaiacol.

be characteristic of Spanish vinegars (**Table 3**). Our data confirm the finding of other authors (15), who, in a stepwise linear discriminant analysis (SLDA) study aimed at differentiating the

aroma of balsamic, Jerez, wine, and cider vinegars, reported that ethyl-2-phenylacetate and methyl salicilate are among the most discriminating variables. In quantitative terms, again, our data



Figure 1. MS spectrum and formula of cyclotene.

agree with previous reports (7, 9-12) for TBVM, BVM, and JVs, respectively, and confirm that those esters strongly related to alcoholic fermentation, such as diethyl succinate and ethylmalate, are almost exclusively present in BVM, VJ, and VR.

It has been suggested that alkyl-substituted 5- or 6-membered cyclic  $\alpha$ -diketones, such as maltol and related compounds, exhibit a typical burnt sugar, sweet maple flavor and that this feature could be due to their stable keto—enolic form (*16*, *17*). These compounds typically arise from hexose thermal or acid-catalyzed degradation (*17*), and some of them have been already reported in foods or beverages, such as coffee (*18*) or sherry wines (*19*). Furthermore, their presence was also noticed in charred woods used in wine and vinegar aging (*20*) as a consequence of pyrolytic degradation of cellulose. For what concern vinegars, Zeppa et al. (*7*) reported the presence of some enolic derivatives (maltol, cyclotene, and 5-hydroxymaltol) in TBVRE, while a furanone with an enol-carbonyl structure (sotolon) was identified in long aged JVs by Callejón et al. (*9*, *10*).

As shown in **Table 3**, our data suggest that TBVM possesses the highest amounts of enolic derivatives in comparison to BVM and VJ. 5-Hydroxymaltol was the main contributor to this class of compounds followed by maltol and cyclotene. To the best of our knowledge, this is the first report on the presence of cyclotene in BVM and JVs. Figure 1 shows its formula and MS spectrum. It is worth mentioning that, for this latter compound, the odor threshold in water is around 0.3 mg/L (21) and may well-contribute to the aromatic complexity of TBVM. None of our samples revealed the presence of sotolon. This can be explained by the relatively low recovery shown by this compound during the extraction process. This low recovery could come from the extremely high solubility of sotolon in water, and therefore, its amount could be reduced during the washing step of the extraction process.

A further enolic compound (3-ethyl-2-hydroxycyclopenten-2-one) was identified exclusively in Italian balsamic vinegars. This volatile, which could be considered the ethyl homologue of cyclotene, possesses a strong burnt-sugar sweet aromatic impact, with an odor threshold notably lower than this latter compound (17). The larger amounts of enolic derivatives in TBVM with respect to JVs and BVM may derive from the initial cooking of the must and the prolonged wood aging of this sugarrich product. On the other side, the weak amounts of 3-ethyl-2-hydroxycyclopenten-2-one in BVM could be due to the admitted practice of caramel addition.

Other classes of volatiles, which originate from sugar thermal degradation, are furanic and pyranic compounds. A wide number of them, in fact, were reported after the heating of glucose solutions, mostly with the presence of amino acids (22, 23). It is known, on the other hand, that TBVM shows a relevant amount of HMF and furfural, together with other furanic derivatives, such as 2-acetylfuran and furoic acid (24).

As expected, both the TBVM type of vinegars had the highest total amount of furanic compounds (**Table 3**), independent from the age of the vinegar. BVM revealed a minor, even if relevant, content of total furans (likely coming from caramel addition), while JVs had the lowest content of these sugar derivatives. HMF was, by far, the major representative (up to 93.5% in TBVM "affinato"), followed by furfural and 5-methylfurfural. In TBVM, 5-acetoxymethylfurfural is a further major furanic compound, which comes from the esterification between acetic acid and HMF. This volatile, already reported in TBVM at a concentration varying from 7.28 mg/kg (7) to 188 mg/kg (24) seems to be characteristic of Italian TBVM and could represent a discriminant parameter between "affinato" and "extravecchio" TBVMs, as already suggested by Giacco et al. (25).

Three further volatiles were found exclusively in Italian TBVM and BVM. They are 2,5-furandicarboxaldehyde, furylhydroxymethyl ketone, and 1*H*-pyrrole-2-carboxaldehyde. All of them may derive from Maillard reactions produced by heating proline or phenylalanine mixtures (26) and have already been reported in toasted oak extracts (20, 27). Their sensory impact has been described as "honey" and "toasty caramel" (27) and, in TBVM and BVM, may derive from the cooking of the must and the caramel addition, respectively. Other furanic derivatives somewhat relevant are 2-acetyl-5-methylfuran, with a nutty reminiscence, and DDMP (2,3-dihydro-2,5-dihydroxy-6-methyl-4*H*-pyran-4-one), the role of which in the Maillard pathway has been described as pivotal for the generation of enolic derivatives (5-hydroxymaltol, maltol, and cyclotene in particular) (22).

Acetoin is a wine constituent initially produced during alcoholic fermentation. When wines are submitted to acetic fermentation, the acetoin amount increases because of the transformation of  $\alpha$ -acetolactate and 2,3-butanediol acted by acetic bacteria (28). Despite the low recovery that this compound showed by the extraction method that we used (13), our data suggest that vinegars coming from wine tend to have a higher amount of this compound, which is characterized by a buttery odor.

Considerable amounts of lactones have been found in our samples, which may come from cyclicization of hydroxyacids during fermentation or from sugar degradation (7). On the other hand, the presence of whiskey lactones is in relationship with wood aging, and the ratio between the two isomers is thought to depend upon the oak species used (29). Quite surprisingly and diversely from the finding of other authors (9), the cis/trans ratio of JVs was found to be <1 (may be because of the prolonged use of old American oak barrels), while in TBVM, that ratio spans between about 2 and 20, probably as a consequence of the use of several wood species (chestnut, juniperus, or mulberry), the cis/trans ratio of which is largely unknown.

Volatile phenols were somewhat higher in JVs. Their presence in vinegars is due to wood aging (this is the case of guaiacol, siringol, and eugenol) or to the biological decarboxylation of cinnamic acids acted by malolatic or *Brettanomyces* bacteria (ethylphenol and ethylguaiacol). As shown in this work, significant differences in ethylphenol were found between wine-based vinegars and TBVM, likely because of the intervention of the bacterial fermentation on the initial wines. For what concern wood-derived phenols, their amounts were almost the same whatever the vinegar type. This finding is partially in contrast with other authors (9) who found the highest concentration of guaiacol in BVM (up to  $300 \mu g/L$ ) but similar amounts of eugenol between JVs, BVM, and red wine vinegars and suggests that the presence of these compounds is independent from the duration of wood aging.

**PCA.** To obtain a comprehensive representation of the main volatiles that could differentiate the vinegar samples, a PCA was carried out on the whole set of data. In **Figure 2**, the localization of the 25 samples in the space formed by the first two components (56% of the variance) is shown. Four groups of samples are



Figure 2. PCA plot of the first two principal components. AF, affinato TBVM; ST, extravecchio TBVM; BV, BVM; VJ, vinagre de Jerez; VR, vinagre de Jerez reserva.

clearly discriminated on the component 1, representing "extravecchio" TVBM, "affinato" TBVM, BVM, and JVs, respectively. It appears, hence, that the two categories of JVs (vinagre de Jerez and reserva) were almost indiscriminated from each other on this factor for which the principal parameters were propanoic and hexanoic acids, *p*-ethylguaiacol, and benzyl alcohol (with a positive sign) and 5-hydroxymethyl-2-furaldehyde, 5-methylfurfural, furfural, and 5-acetoxymethyl-2-furaldehyde (with a negative sign). Interestingly, the only discriminated sample of vinagre de Jerez (on the upper right side of the graph) was obtained from sherry vinegar with *Pedro Ximenez* grape must addition. Component 2 discriminated both the "extravecchio" TBVM and JVs from "affinato" TBVM and BVM. Parameters that mainly accounted for this variance were caprolactone, ethyl-3-hydroxybutyrate, and 1,2,3-propanetriol diacetate.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We thank Prof. Andrea Antonelli (University of Modena and Reggio Emilia) and the "Consorzio Tutela Aceto Balsamico Tradizionale di Modena" for the kind supply of the samples of traditional balsamic vinegar of Modena.

## LITERATURE CITED

- (1) http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/foodqual/quali1\_en.htm.
- (2) European Commission. Reg. CE number 813, April 20, 2000.
- (3) Boletín Oficial Junta Andalucía (BOJA), number 184, Sept 5 (DOP Vinagre de Jerez and DOP Vinagre Condado de Huelva).
- $(4)\ http://www.politicheagricole.it/ProdottiQualita/ProdottiDop/default.htm.$
- (5) Piva, A.; Di Mattia, C.; Neri, L.; Dimitri, G.; Chiarini, M.; Sacchetti, G. Heat-induced chemical, physical and functional changes during grape must cooking. *Food Chem.* 2008, *106*, 1057–1065.
- (6) Gullo, M; Giudici, P. Acetic acid bacteria in traditional balsamic vinegar: Phenotypic traits relevant for starter cultures selection. <u>Int.</u> <u>J. Food Microbiol</u>. 2008, 125, 46–53.
- (7) Zeppa, G.; Giordano, M.; Gerbi, V.; Meglioli, G. Characterisation of volatile compounds in three acetification batteries used for the production of "Aceto Balsamico Tradizionale di Reggio Emilia". *Ital. J. Food Sci.* 2002, 14, 248–266.
- (8) Del Signore, A. Chemometric analysis and volatile compounds of traditional balsamic vinegars from Modena. <u>J. Food Eng</u>. 2001, 50, 77–90.
- (9) Callejón, R. M.; Morales, L.; Silva Ferreira, A. C.; Troncoso, A. M. Targeting the typical aroma of sherry vinegar: Sensory and chemical approach. *J. Agric. Food Chem*, **2008**, *56*, 8086–8095.
- (10) Callejón, R. M.; Morales, M. L.; Troncoso, A. M.; Silva Ferriera, A. C. Targeting key aromatic substances on the typical aroma of sherry vinegar. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **2008**, *56*, 6631–6639.
- (11) Natera Marín, R.; Castro Mejías, R.; de Valme García Moreno, M.; García Rowe, F.; García Barroso, C. Headspace solid-phase microextraction analysis of aroma compounds in vinegar validation study. J. Chromatogr., <u>A</u> 2002, 967, 261–267.
- (12) Durán Guerrero, E.; Natera Marín, R.; Castro Mejías, R.; García Barroso, C. Stir bar sorptive extraction of volatile compounds in vinegar: Validation study and comparison with solid phase microextraction. *J. Chromatogr.*, *A* 2007, *1167*, 18–26.
- (13) Durán Guerrero, E.; Chinnici, F.; Natali, N.; Natera Marín, R.; Riponi, C. Solid-phase extraction method for determination of volatile compounds in traditional balsamic vinegars. <u>J. Sep. Sci.</u> 2008, 31, 3030–3036.
- (14) Swiegers, J. H.; Bartowsky, E. J.; Henschke, P. A.; Pretorius, I. S. Yeast and bacterial modulation of wine aroma and flavour. <u>Aust. J.</u> <u>Grape Wine Res.</u> 2005, 11, 139–173.
- (15) Pizarro, C.; Esteban-Díez, I.; Saenz-González, C.; González-Saiz, J. M. Vinegar classification based on feature extraction and selection of headspace solid-phase microextraction/gas chromatography volatile anlyses: A feasibility study. <u>Anal. Chim. Acta</u> 2008, 608, 38–47.
- (16) Tateba, H.; Mihara, S. Structure-odor relationship in monoterpenes. <u>Agric. Biol. Chem</u>. 1990, 54, 2271–2276.

- (17) Pittet, A.; Rittersbacher, P.; Muralidhara, R. Flavor properties of compounds related to maltol and isomaltol. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **1970**, *18*, 929–933.
- (18) Friedel, P.; Krampl, V.; Radford, T.; Renner, J. A.; Shephard, F. W.; Gianturco, M. A. Some constituents of the aroma complex of coffee. J. Agric. Food Chem. 1971, 19, 530–532.
- (19) Moreno, J. A.; Zea, L.; Moyani, L.; Medina, M. Aroma compounds as markers of the changes in sherry wines subjected to biological ageing. *Food Chem.* 2005, 16, 333–338.
- (20) Natali, N.; Chinnici, F.; Riponi, C. Characterization of volatiles in extracts from oak chips obtained by accelerated solvent extraction (ASE). <u>J. Agric. Food Chem</u>. 2006, 54, 8190–8198.
- (21) http://www.leffingwell.com/burnt.htm.
- (22) Kim, M.; Baltes, W. On the role of 2,3-dihydro-3,5-dihydroxy-6methyl-4(*H*)-pyran-4-one in the Maillard reaction. <u>J. Agric. Food</u> <u>Chem.</u> 1996, 44, 282–289.
- (23) Cutzach, I.; Chatonnet, P.; Henry, R.; Dubourdieu, D. Identification of volatile compounds with a "toasty" aroma in heated oak used in barrelmaking. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 1997, 45, 2217–2224.
- (24) Chinnici, F.; Masino, F.; Antonelli, A. Determination of furanic compounds in traditional balsamic vinegars by ion-exclusion liquid

chromatography and diode array detection. <u>J. Chromatogr. Sci.</u> 2003, 41, 305–310.

- (25) Giacco, M.; del Signore, A. Il contenuto di 5-acetossimetil-2furaldeide nell'aceto balsamico tradizionale di Modena e Reggio Emilia. *Riv. Merceol.* **1997**, *36*, 91–97.
- (26) Baltes, W.; Mevissen, L. Model reactions on roast aroma formation. VI. Volatile reaction products from the reaction of phenylalanine with glucose during cooking and roasting. Z. Lebensm.-Unters.-Forsch. 1988, 187, 209–214.
- (27) Cutzach, I.; Chatonnet, P.; Henry, R.; Dubourdieu, D. Identifying new volatile compounds in toasted oak. <u>J. Agric. Food Chem</u>. 1999, 47, 1663–1667.
- (28) Asai, T. Acetic Acid Bacteria: Classification and Biochemical Activities; University Park Press and University Tokyo Press: Tokyo, Japan, 1968; p 343.
- (29) Waterhouse, A. L.; Towey, J. P. Oak lactones isomer ratio distinguishes between wines fermented in American and French oak barrels. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* **1994**, *42*, 1971–1974.

Received for Review December 24, 2008. Revised manuscript received April 6, 2009. Accepted April 08, 2009.